

Table of Contents

	Page
Abstract	I
Acknowledgements	IV
Table of Contents	V
List of Tables	X
List of Figures	XIII
List of Appendices	XIV
Publications, Presentations, and Awards arising from this thesis	XVI
List of Abbreviations	XVII
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Research Problem	1
1.2 Significance.....	1
1.3 Research Question and Aim	2
1.4 Approach Adopted.....	2
Chapter 2 Literature Review	4
2.1 Ventilator-Associated Pneumonia.....	4
2.1.1 <i>Definition</i>	4
2.1.2 <i>Incidence</i>	4
2.1.3 <i>Significance</i>	6
2.1.3.a <i>Morbidity</i>	6
2.1.3.b <i>Mortality</i>	7
2.1.3.c <i>Financial costs</i>	7
2.1.4 <i>Pathogenesis</i>	8
2.1.5 <i>Risk factors</i>	9
2.1.6 <i>Diagnosis</i>	11
2.1.6.a <i>Clinical criteria</i>	11
2.1.6.b <i>Non-invasive methods</i>	12
2.1.6.c <i>Invasive techniques</i>	13
2.1.6.d <i>Diagnosis summary</i>	13
2.1.7 <i>Prevention</i>	14
2.1.8 <i>Management</i>	15
2.2 Acquired Brain Injury	16
2.2.1 <i>Definition</i>	16
2.2.2 <i>Incidence</i>	17
2.2.3 <i>Management</i>	17
2.2.4 <i>Ventilator-associated pneumonia in acquired brain injury</i>	18
2.3 Respiratory Physiotherapy in the Intensive Care Unit	19

	Page
2.3.1	<i>Background</i> 19
2.3.1.a	Positioning 20
2.3.1.b	Manual hyperinflation 20
2.3.1.c	Suctioning 21
2.3.1.d	Other respiratory physiotherapy techniques 23
2.3.2	<i>Service provision</i> 26
2.3.3	<i>Role in ventilator-associated pneumonia</i> 27
2.3.4	<i>Effectiveness of respiratory physiotherapy in the intensive care unit</i> 28
2.4	Summary 30
Chapter 3	Research Method 32
3.1	Study Design and Aims..... 32
3.2	Research Hypotheses 33
3.3	Subjects 34
3.3.1	<i>Inclusion criteria</i> 34
3.3.2	<i>Exclusion criteria</i> 34
3.3.3	<i>Withdrawal criteria</i> 35
3.3.4	<i>Sample size</i> 36
3.3.4.a	Part A 36
3.3.4.b	Part B 37
3.4	Variables 37
3.4.1	<i>Independent</i> 37
3.4.2	<i>Dependent</i> 37
3.4.2.a	Incidence of ventilator-associated pneumonia 37
3.4.2.b	Duration of mechanical ventilation 38
3.4.2.c	Length of intensive care unit stay 39
3.4.2.d	Withdrawal rates 39
3.4.3	<i>Other clinical variables</i> 39
3.5	Procedures 39
3.5.1	<i>Randomisation</i> 40
3.5.2	<i>Physiotherapy intervention</i> 40
3.5.2.a	Positioning 40
3.5.2.b	Manual hyperinflation 41
3.5.2.c	Airway suctioning 42
3.5.2.d	Treatment duration 42
3.5.3	<i>Control group</i> 43
3.5.4	<i>General management</i> 43
3.5.5	<i>Data acquisition</i> 44
3.5.5.a	CPIS – temperature 44
3.5.5.b	CPIS - blood leukocyte count 45

	Page
3.5.5.c CPIS - tracheal secretions	45
3.5.5.d CPIS - oxygenation: PaO ₂ /FiO ₂	45
3.5.5.e CPIS - pulmonary radiography	45
3.5.5.f CPIS - culture of tracheal aspirate	46
3.5.6 <i>Non broncho-alveolar lavage</i>	46
3.5.7 <i>Summary of blinding measures</i>	47
3.6 Statistical Analyses	47
3.7 Ethical Issues	48
3.8 Facilities and Resources	49
Chapter 4 Results	50
4.1 Part A	50
4.1.1 <i>Subject recruitment and allocation</i>	50
4.1.2 <i>Periodic interim analysis</i>	50
4.1.3 <i>Exclusions</i>	51
4.1.4 <i>Intention to treat analysis</i>	52
4.1.4.a Demographic and descriptive data	52
4.1.5 <i>Intention to treat analysis: dependent variables</i>	54
4.1.5.a Incidence of ventilator-associated pneumonia	54
4.1.5.b Other dependent variables	55
4.1.5.c Clinical information	55
4.1.6 <i>Subjects not receiving all Part A allocated intervention</i>	60
4.1.7 <i>Analysis by treatment</i>	62
4.1.7.a Demographic and descriptive data	62
4.1.8 <i>Analysis by treatment: dependent variables</i>	64
4.1.8.a Incidence of ventilator-associated pneumonia	64
4.1.8.b Other dependent variables	64
4.1.8.c Clinical information	65
4.1.9 <i>Summary of Part A results</i>	66
4.2 Part B	67
4.2.1 <i>Subject recruitment and allocation</i>	67
4.2.2 <i>Part B - Intention to treat analysis</i>	68
4.2.2.a Demographic and descriptive data	68
4.2.3 <i>Part B - Intention to treat analysis: dependent variables</i>	70
4.2.3.a Duration of mechanical ventilation and length of stay	70
4.2.3.b Clinical information	70
4.2.4 <i>Subjects not receiving all Part B allocated interventions</i>	75
4.2.5 <i>Part B - Analysis by treatment</i>	77
4.2.5.a Demographic and descriptive data	77
4.2.6 <i>Part B - Analysis by treatment: dependent variables</i>	79
4.2.6.a Duration of mechanical ventilation and length of stay	79
4.2.6.b Clinical information	79

	Page
4.2.7 <i>Summary of Part B results</i>	80
4.3 Comparison between subjects with and without ventilator-associated pneumonia	80
4.4 Results Summary	83
Chapter 5 Economic Evaluation	84
5.1 Introduction	84
5.2 Aims and Significance	85
5.3 Methodology	86
5.3.1.a Background	86
5.3.1.b The question addressed	86
5.3.1.c Procedure	87
5.3.1.d Costing of physiotherapy services	88
5.3.2 <i>Data analysis</i>	89
5.4 Study Outcomes	89
5.5 Economic Analysis Results	89
5.5.1 <i>Costs</i>	89
5.5.2 <i>Summary costs</i>	90
5.5.2.a Part A	90
5.5.2.b Part B	90
5.5.2.c Comparison between subjects with and without ventilator-associated pneumonia	92
5.5.3 <i>Physiotherapy cost relative to bed day cost</i>	96
5.6 Cost Comparison with Outcomes	96
5.6.1.a Incidence of ventilator-associated pneumonia	96
5.6.1.b Duration of mechanical ventilation	97
5.6.1.c Length of intensive care unit stay	98
5.7 Conclusion	98
Chapter 6 Discussion	100
6.1 Study Methodology	100
6.1.1 <i>Study design</i>	100
6.1.1.a Randomisation	100
6.1.1.b Blinding	101
6.1.2 <i>Treatment regimen</i>	102
6.1.3 <i>Clinical stability</i>	103
6.1.3.a Exclusions	103
6.1.3.b Subjects not receiving allocated intervention	103
6.1.3.c Neurological status	104
6.1.3.d Haemodynamic and respiratory status	104
6.1.3.e Summary	105

	Page
6.1.4 <i>Control of clinical management</i>	105
6.1.5 <i>Outcome measures</i>	106
6.1.5.a Incidence of ventilator-associated pneumonia	107
6.1.5.b Duration of mechanical ventilation	108
6.1.5.c Length of intensive care unit stay	108
6.1.5.d Summary	108
6.1.6 <i>Statistical power</i>	109
6.1.6.a Part A	109
6.1.6.b Part B	109
6.2 Research Findings.....	109
6.2.1 <i>Part A</i>	110
6.2.1.a Incidence of ventilator-associated pneumonia	110
6.2.1.b Duration of mechanical ventilation	112
6.2.1.c Length of intensive care unit stay	113
6.2.2 <i>Part B</i>	114
6.2.2.a Duration of mechanical ventilation	114
6.2.2.b Length of intensive care unit stay	115
6.2.3 <i>Economic analysis</i>	115
6.2.3.a Incidence of ventilator-associated pneumonia	116
6.2.3.b Duration of mechanical ventilation	116
6.2.3.c Length of intensive care unit stay	117
6.3 Implications for Clinical Practice	117
6.4 Limitations of the Study	118
6.5 Recommendations for Future Research.....	121
Chapter 7 Conclusions	123
Chapter 8 References	125
Appendix 1 Subject Information and Consent Form	143
Appendix 2 Part A - Summary Results of Group Comparison	144
Appendix 3 Part B - Summary Results of Group Comparison	154
Appendix 4 Comparison of Subjects With and Without Ventilator-Associated Pneumonia	167
Appendix 5 Summary Results of Economic Evaluation	169

List of Tables

	Page	
Table 2.1	Summary of risk factors for nosocomial pneumonia and ventilator-associated pneumonia	10
Table 2.2	Strategies for prevention of VAP	15
Table 3.1	Admission data of RPH patients in ICU satisfying study inclusion criteria (1995 - 2000)	36
Table 3.2	Clinical pulmonary infection score (CPIS)	38
Table 4.1	Reasons for exclusion of eligible subjects	52
Table 4.2	Demographic characteristics of the 144 subjects in Part A of the study	53
Table 4.3	Incidence of VAP in the 144 subjects in Part A of the study	54
Table 4.4	Primary bacteriology characteristics of subjects with VAP	54
Table 4.5	Duration of mechanical ventilation and length of stay for the 144 subjects in Part A of the study	55
Table 4.6	Clinical information for the 144 subjects in Part A of the study	55
Table 4.7	Daily mean CPIS and PaO ₂ /FiO ₂ data for the subjects in Part A of the study	56
Table 4.8	Reasons why the 16 included subjects did not complete their allocated intervention	60
Table 4.9	Demographic characteristics of the 16 study subjects who did not complete their allocated Part A intervention	61
Table 4.10	Analysis by treatment: demographic characteristics of the 128 subjects who completed interventions of Part A of the study	63
Table 4.11	Analysis by treatment: incidence of VAP in the 128 subjects who completed interventions of Part A of the study	64
Table 4.12	Analysis by treatment: duration of mechanical ventilation and length of stay for the 128 subjects who completed interventions of Part A of the study	65
Table 4.13	Analysis by treatment: clinical information for the 128 subjects who completed interventions of Part A of the study	65
Table 4.14	Part B group allocation of the 33 subjects, with reference to Part A intervention	68
Table 4.15	Demographic characteristics of the 33 Part B subjects	69
Table 4.16	Duration of mechanical ventilation and length of stay for the 33 subjects in Part B of the study	70
Table 4.17	Clinical information for the 33 subjects in Part B of the study	70
Table 4.18	Daily mean CPIS and PaO ₂ /FiO ₂ data for the subjects in Part B of the study	71
Table 4.19	Demographic characteristics of the four subjects not completing their allocated Part B intervention	76

	Page	
Table 4.20	Analysis by treatment: demographic characteristics of the 29 subjects who completed interventions of Part B of the study	78
Table 4.21	Analysis by treatment: duration of mechanical ventilation and length of stay for the 29 subjects who completed interventions of Part B of the study	79
Table 4.22	Analysis by treatment: clinical information for the 29 subjects who completed interventions of Part B of the study	79
Table 4.23	Comparison of demographic characteristics between the non-VAP and VAP subjects	81
Table 4.24	Comparison of duration of mechanical ventilation and length of stay for the non-VAP and VAP subjects	82
Table 4.25	Comparison of clinical information for the non-VAP and VAP subjects	82
Table 5.1	Physiotherapy staff time costs per hour	90
Table 5.2	Summary cost analysis data	92

Tables in Appendices

Appendix Table 2.1.1	Pearson chi-square test results - Part A intention to treat analysis	144
Appendix Table 2.1.2	Independent samples t-test results - Part A intention to treat analysis	145
Appendix Table 2.2.3	Part A subjects not receiving all allocated interventions vs. all others	150
Appendix Table 2.2.4	Independent samples t-test results - Part A subjects not receiving all allocated interventions vs. all others	151
Appendix Table 2.3.1	Pearson chi-square test results - Part A analysis by treatment	152
Appendix Table 2.3.2	Independent samples t-test results - Part A analysis by treatment	153
Appendix Table 3.1.1	Pearson chi-square test results - Part B intention to treat analysis	154
Appendix Table 3.1.2	Independent samples t-test results - Part B intention to treat analysis	155
Appendix Table 3.2.1	Part B subjects not receiving all allocated interventions vs. all others	160
Appendix Table 3.2.2	Independent samples t-test results - Part B subjects not receiving all allocated intervention vs. all others	161
Appendix Table 3.3.1	Pearson chi-square test results - Part B analysis by treatment	162

	Page	
Appendix Table 3.3.2	Independent samples t-test results - Part B analysis by treatment	163
Appendix Table 4.1.1	Pearson chi-square test results – subjects with VAP vs. subjects without VAP intention to treat analysis	167
Appendix Table 4.1.2	Independent samples t-test results – subjects with VAP vs. subjects without VAP intention to treat analysis	168
Appendix Table 5.1.1	Mean physiotherapy workload data and costs, shift by shift, for Part A	170
Appendix Table 5.1.2	Part A summary physiotherapy workload data and costs	171
Appendix Table 5.1.3	Indexed Part A summary respiratory physiotherapy costs – Cost 1	172
Appendix Table 5.1.4	Indexed summary costs for ICU MV bed day cost per subject, as per Part A group allocation	173
Appendix Table 5.1.5	Indexed Part A summary respiratory physiotherapy costs for 14 Treatment Group 1 subjects with VAP	174
Appendix Table 5.2.1	Mean physiotherapy workload data and costs, shift by shift, for Part B	175
Appendix Table 5.2.2	Part B summary physiotherapy workload data and costs	176
Appendix Table 5.2.3	Indexed Part B summary respiratory physiotherapy costs – Cost 2 & Cost 3	177
Appendix Table 5.2.4	Indexed summary costs for ICU MV bed day cost for Part B subjects, as per group allocation	178
Appendix Table 5.3.1	Mean physiotherapy occasion-of-service workload data, shift by shift, comparing subjects with and without VAP	180
Appendix Table 5.3.2	Mean physiotherapy time-unit workload data, shift by shift, comparing subjects with and without VAP	181
Appendix Table 5.3.3	Mean physiotherapy summary workload data, comparing subjects with and without VAP	182
Appendix Table 5.3.4	Indexed summary costs for the 58 non-VAP subjects from Part A Treatment Group 1 – Cost 4	183
Appendix Table 5.3.5	Indexed summary costs for the 53 non-VAP subjects from Part A Control Group 2 – Cost 5	184
Appendix Table 5.3.6	Indexed summary costs for the 20 VAP subjects who received any respiratory physiotherapy	185
Appendix Table 5.3.7	Indexed summary ICU MV bed day costs for subjects with and without VAP	186
Appendix Table 5.3.8	Indexed summary costs for ICU MV bed day cost per subject, as per Part A group allocation	187

List of Figures

		Page
Figure 3.1	Flow diagram illustrating the study design	33
Figure 4.1	Flow diagram of the process of randomisation for Part A of the study	51
Figure 4.2	Daily mean CPIS data for the subjects in Part A of the study	57
Figure 4.3	Daily mean PaO ₂ /FiO ₂ data (best of day) for the subjects in Part A of the study	58
Figure 4.4	Daily PaO ₂ /FiO ₂ data (worst of day) for the subjects in Part A of the study	59
Figure 4.5	Flow diagram of the process of randomisation for Part B of the study	67
Figure 4.6	Daily mean CPIS data for the subjects in Part B of the study	72
Figure 4.7	Daily mean PaO ₂ /FiO ₂ data (best of day) for the subjects in Part B of the study	73
Figure 4.8	Daily PaO ₂ /FiO ₂ data (worst of day) for the subjects in Part B of the study	74
Figure 5.1	Flow diagram of study design and points of cost determination	91
Figure 5.2	ICU MV bed day cost for all the Part A subjects	94
Figure 5.3	Total physiotherapy cost per subject for Part A Treatment Group 1 subjects	94
Figure 5.4	ICU MV bed day cost for all the Part B subjects	95
Figure 5.5	Total physiotherapy cost per subject for Part B Treatment Group 3 subjects	95

Figures in Appendices

Appendix Figure 5.1	Graph of extrapolated health price index for 2003/2004	169
---------------------	--	-----

List of Appendices

	Page
Appendix 1 Subject Information and Consent Form	143
Appendix 2 Part A - Summary Results of Group Comparison	144
Appendix 2.1 Part A – Intention to Treat Analysis	144
<i>A 2.1.1 Part A intention to treat analysis: demographic and dependent variable details</i>	<i>144</i>
Appendix 2.2 Part A – Subjects Not Receiving All Allocated Interventions vs. All Others	150
<i>A 2.2.1 Part A subjects not receiving all allocated interventions vs. all others - demographic and dependent variable details</i>	<i>150</i>
Appendix 2.3 Part A – Analysis by Treatment	152
<i>A 2.3.1 Part A – Analysis by treatment - demographic and dependent variable details</i>	<i>152</i>
Appendix 3 Part B - Summary Results of Group Comparison	154
Appendix 3.1 Part B –Intention to Treat Analysis	154
<i>A 3.1.1 Part B –Intention to treat analysis: demographic and dependent variable details</i>	<i>154</i>
Appendix 3.2 Part B – Subjects Not Receiving All Allocated Interventions vs. All Others	160
<i>A 3.2.1 Part B subjects not receiving all allocated interventions vs. all others - demographic and dependent variable details</i>	<i>160</i>
Appendix 3.3 Part B – Analysis by treatment	162
<i>A 3.3.1 Part B analysis by treatment: demographic and dependent variable details</i>	<i>162</i>
Appendix 4 Comparison of Subjects With and Without VAP	167
Appendix 4.1 Subjects With and Without VAP: intention to treat analysis	167
<i>A 4.1.1 Comparison of subjects with and without VAP - intention to treat analysis: summary demographic and dependent variables data</i>	<i>167</i>
Appendix 5 Summary Results of Economic Evaluation	169
Appendix 5.1 Part A - Physiotherapy workload and costs data.....	169
<i>A 5.1.1 Health price index</i>	<i>169</i>
Appendix 5.2 Part B - Physiotherapy workload and costs data.....	175
<i>A 5.2.2 Indexed Part B summary respiratory physiotherapy costs</i>	<i>177</i>
Appendix 5.3 Subjects with and without VAP - Physiotherapy workload and costs data	179

List of Appendices

	Page
<i>A 5.3.1 Respiratory physiotherapy workload and cost determination for subjects with and without VAP</i>	179
<i>A 5.3.2 Occasions of service</i>	179
<i>A 5.3.3 Time units</i>	181
<i>A 5.3.4 Indexed summary costs for the 58 non-VAP subjects from Part A Treatment Group 1</i>	183
<i>A 5.3.5 Indexed summary costs for the 53 non-VAP subjects from Part A Control Group 2</i>	184
<i>A 5.3.6 Indexed summary costs for the 111 non-VAP subjects</i>	186
<i>A 5.3.7 Indexed summary costs for all subjects</i>	187

Publications, Presentations, and Awards arising from this thesis

Awarded a 2001 seeding grant from the Physiotherapy Research Foundation of the Australian Physiotherapy Association.



Patman, S., Stiller, K., Blackmore, M. & Jenkins, S. 2003, 'The effect of chest physiotherapy on the prevention and treatment of nosocomial pneumonia for intensive care patients with acquired brain injury - preliminary results', *Australian Journal of Physiotherapy*, vol. 49 e-AJP Electronic Supplement, p. 12.

- Presented at the Australian Physiotherapy Association 8th National Cardiothoracic Group Conference, Brisbane, QLD, 4-6 September 2003

Patman, S., Stiller, K., Blackmore, M. & Jenkins, S. 2004a, 'Physiotherapy and nosocomial pneumonia in intensive care patients with acquired brain injury', *Anaesthesia and Intensive Care*, vol. 32, p. 132.

- Presented at the Australian & New Zealand Intensive Care Society (ANZICS) 28th Annual Scientific Meeting on Intensive Care, Cairns, QLD, 10-14 September 2003

Patman, S., Stiller, K., Blackmore, M. & Jenkins, S. 2004b, 'The influence of physiotherapy on ventilator-associated pneumonia in acquired brain injury patients', in Proceedings of the *Australian Physiotherapy Association 8th International Physiotherapy Congress*, Adelaide, SA, p. 109.

- Awarded the 'Australian Journal of Physiotherapy Award for Excellence in Research' for the best research presentation at the *Australian Physiotherapy Association 8th International Physiotherapy Congress*, Adelaide, SA, 15-18 May 2004.



Patman, S., Stiller, K. & Jenkins, S. 2004c, 'Physiotherapy and ventilator-associated pneumonia in patients with acquired brain injury', *Intensive Care Medicine*, vol. 30, p. S83.

- Presented at the European Society of Intensive Care Medicine 17th Annual Congress, Berlin, Germany, 10-13 October 2004.

Patman, S., Stiller, K. & Jenkins, S. 2005, 'Physiotherapy for ventilator-associated pneumonia in patients with acquired brain injury'

- Accepted for presentation at the Australian Physiotherapy Association 9th National Cardiothoracic Group Conference, Melbourne, Vic, 13-15 October 2005

Patman, S., Stiller, K., Geelhoed, E. & Jenkins, S. 2005, 'The financial costs associated with respiratory physiotherapy for ventilator-associated pneumonia in patients with acquired brain injury'

- Accepted for presentation at the Australian Physiotherapy Association 9th National Cardiothoracic Group Conference, Melbourne, Vic, 13-15 October 2005

List of Abbreviations

ABG	arterial blood gas
ABI	acquired brain injury
APACHE	acute physiological and chronic health evaluation
ARDS	acute respiratory distress syndrome
ASA	American Society of Anaesthesia
BAL	broncho-alveolar lavage
BMI	body mass index
COPD	chronic obstructive pulmonary disease
CPIS	clinical pulmonary infection score
CPP	cerebral perfusion pressure
CT	computerised tomography
CXR	chest x-ray
ETA	endotracheal aspirate
ETT	endotracheal tube
FiO₂	fraction of inspired oxygen
GADP	gravity-assisted drainage position
GCS	Glasgow Coma Scale
H₂	histamine type 2
HME	heat-moisture exchanger
HR	heart rate
ICP	intracranial pressure
ICU	intensive care unit
NBL	non broncho-alveolar lavage
MAP	mean arterial pressure
MH	manual hyperinflation
MV	mechanical ventilation
NP	nosocomial pneumonia
O₂	oxygen
PaCO₂	arterial carbon dioxide tension
PaO₂	arterial oxygen tension
PEEP	positive end expiratory pressure
PSB	protected specimen brush
RPH	Royal Perth Hospital
SAPS	simplified acute physiological score
USA	United States of America
VAP	ventilator-associated pneumonia
vs.	versus
WA	Western Australia

Unit of measurement

cmH₂O	centimetres of water
hr	hour
mg	milligram
ml	millilitre
mmHg	millimetres of Mercury
°C	degrees Celsius
\$	dollar
AUD\$	Australian dollars
DM	Deutschmark
US\$	American dollars

Statistical terms and symbols

α	alpha level
χ^2	Chi-Square test
d	effect size index for the t-test
df	degrees of freedom
F	test statistic for the analysis of variance
n	number of subjects
p	probability value
SD	standard deviation
Sig.	significance level
Std	standard
t	test statistic for the comparison of two means
%	per cent
<	less than
≤	less than or equal to
>	greater than
≥	greater than or equal to